

PASTORALISM UNDER PRESSURE

© Copyright Shaker Publishing 2001

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

Printed in The Netherlands.

ISBN 90-423-0168-6

Shaker Publishing BV
St. Maartenslaan 26
6221 AX Maastricht
Tel.: 043-3500424
Fax: 043-3255090
[http:// www.shaker.nl](http://www.shaker.nl)

PASTORALISM UNDER PRESSURE

Land alienation and pastoral transformations
among the Karrayu of Eastern Ethiopia,
1941 to the present

A thesis submitted by

Ayalew Gebre
(Ethiopia)

in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES
Institute of Social Studies
The Hague, The Netherlands
November 2001

Thesis Committee

Promotores:

Professor M.R. Doornbos, Institute of Social Studies
Professor M.A.R.M. Salih, Institute of Social Studies

Examiners:

Professor Abdel Ghaffar M. Ahmed, Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa (OSSREA)
Professor J. Markakis, University of Crete
Professor J.B. Opschoor, Institute of Social Studies

This dissertation is part of the research program of CERES
Research School for Resource Studies for Development

DEDICATION

In loving memory of my late mother Tadelech Ali,
for showing me the firm ground and for the gift of her values.
She has my eternal gratitude for all she had done for me.
I feel very sad that she did not live to see that my efforts
have finally come to fruition.

Acknowledgements

There are many people and institutions who contributed to bring this Ph.D. project to fruition and to whom I would like to use this space to express my gratitude. My first intellectual debt is to my doctoral promoters, Professor Martin Doornbos and Professor Mohamed Salih. The incisive comments they both gave me in my various draft chapters helped me to clarify my thinking enormously and prevent some serious missteps and to consider different, more interesting analytical and methodological insights. Their wise questions, suggestions and constructive critiques have rendered this dissertation a readable and acceptable piece of research. Moreover, the combination of tremendous trust and very optimistic attitude they bestowed upon me, in fact, were blessings for me to have ample intellectual space to maneuver and proceed with my research and finish it within more or less the required time frame.

I would also like to thank my field supervisor Professor Abdel Ghaffar Mohamed Ahmed, the Executive Secretary of the Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa, for his guidance, follow-up and his willingness to offer me his time during my stay for the field research in Ethiopia. I owe an enormous debt and my warmest thanks to my colleague Dr. Alula Pankhurst and my friend Dr. Awol Indris for the scholarly suggestions and editing they made on the draft manuscript. Many thanks indeed are due to Dr. Johan Helland, senior Research Fellow at Chr. Michelsen Institute, Norway, for his continues encouragement and keen interest he has been showing right from the inception of my idea for this study.

I must express my wholehearted gratitude to the Karrayu in general for sharing with me an invaluable wealth of their collective life experience and the hospitality shown me during the period of the field research. They graciously tolerated the probing and often perplexing questions of a student of pastoral anthropology. It will be difficult to single out all the Karrayu who assisted me with my research during my stay in their country. However, I am particularly

indebted to Hajji Qeseru Jillo, Hajji Gada Hollo, and Godana Jillo for the important role they played as key informants in supplying a bulk of the historical data for the study. Especially worth mentioning are the rich historical perspectives and detailed knowledge of the land issue that these individuals possess. Apart from this, I must thank Hajji Qeseru and his family for playing a host to the researcher at their homestead for most of the field period. Also deserving of my gratitude is Tedecho Borru who made a valuable contribution to the research as an interpreter, assistant and data collector. His co-operation and assistance in these capacities was valuable through the entire exercise of the field research.

During my period of fieldwork in Karrayu land, I enlisted the help of many organizations. I wish to acknowledge the support provided by the administration of the Metehara Sugar Estate, the Nura Era Plantation, the Awash National Park, and CARE-Awash for allowing me to have unhindered access to their archival materials and documents. The initial stage of my field research was made amenable due to the generous hospitality I received from the staff of CARE-Ethiopia at Awash Station. I am grateful to all of them.

I am grateful to the Institute of Social Studies (ISS) which kindly gave me the opportunity to undertake my Ph. D. research through the generous financial support of the Netherlands Fellowship Programme (NFP). I further wish to express my deep gratitude to the Department of Sociology and Social Administration, Addis Ababa University, for granting me a lengthy leave of absence to continue my study in the Netherlands.

I would like to take this moment to express my appreciation to the following individuals at ISS whose help has been of vital importance. Ank van den Berg, head of the students' affairs, has always been very understanding and continually supportive throughout, and her pleasant and congenial personality gives zest to Ph.D. life at ISS. Special thanks are due to Dita Walenkamp, Maureen Koster, and Els van der Weele whose diligence and perseverance have been a constant source of optimism in the long Ph.D. trajectory. I cherish Wicky Meynen for her encouragement and words of comfort during the tough times when my work had been dampened by events outside my research.

At ISS, I had the opportunity to associate very good Ph.D. student colleagues that helped me to lessen the pain of being far away from home and escape the terrible loneliness when this was needed. Most of all, I cherish the good spirit and intellectual company of my year mates, Getnet Alemu, Richmond Tiemoko, Anne Karanja, Grace Fisiy, Karin Gabriel, Najmi Yousaf, and Xiaoke Zang. I will also remember my friendship with Abebe Haile Gabriel, Terefe Degefa, Merera Gudina, Hayyalu Shiferaw, Merra Tegegne, Theodros Bekaffa, Mahmoud El Zain, Alex Izurieta, Ranjit Dwivedi, Maha Mahfouz, N.C. Narayanan, Imani Tafari, Men Ngo, P.K. Vijayan, Hannington

Odame, Claudius Preville, Omu Kakujaha, and Mathew Kurian. I also enjoyed the continues encouragement of the following friends outside ISS: Andualem Bezabih, Wondiferaw Ambaye, Aregawi Berhe, Emanuel Tolla, and Abera Aderaye.

The help, support and trust of many people in Ethiopia have allowed me to complete this work. These people are too numerous to list here. However, I owe a great deal to my sister in-laws Addisalem and Mulubrehan and brother in-laws Alebachew, Yihenew, Haileyesus and Amdebrehan. All those years they wholeheartedly stood by me, encouraging me to continue with my studies. My profound thanks go in particular to Sister Addisalem Kassie for comforting and in very many ways assisting my family during the entire period of my study leave abroad. My brother Tesfaye and my sister Fentaye I thank for their interest and encouragement.

Finally, nothing would have been possible were it not for my wife Tenagnework Kassie, who was always patient and emotionally supportive and appreciably endured the pain of separation longer than is perhaps justified. In effect, she has immensely assisted the writing of this dissertation by assuming a disproportionate share of the tasks of raising our two children, Mekbib and Dawit. Tenagnework has been more than just an understanding wife. She even sacrificed her own career to single-handedly shoulder the family responsibility. Her support and very loving partnership helped me to endure the most difficult times during this five-year long project. Last but not least, to my children – Mekbib and Dawit – I owe you a great deal for bearing my physical absence for a number of years calmly wondering when “Ayalew would finish his study in Holland”. You have been tender and very tolerant, willing to understand a father who was not able to share with you all the times you certainly deserve; and I lovingly beg your forgiveness for not being with you during times you needed my presence the most.

Ayalew Gebre
June 2001
The Hague

Contents

<i>List of Maps, Tables and Figures</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Acronyms</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Glossary</i>	<i>xxI</i>

1 Introduction	1
1 Aim and scope of the study	1
2 The research problem in context	5
3 Objectives of the study and working hypotheses	7
4 The research area	8
5 The people	12
6 Data material and research methodology	14
1 Written records and archival material	15
2 Primary data collection based on fieldwork	16
1 Problems and limitations	16
2 Units of data collection and analysis.....	17
3 Types of data and methods.....	18
3 Data analysis	23
7 Fieldwork experience and motivation	24
8 Organization of the book	26
Notes	29
2 Some considerations on the transformation of nomadic pastoral societies; A theoretical overview	31
1 Introduction	31
2 The changing context of pastoralism.....	32
1 Pastoral land tenure	33
2 Commercialisation of pastoral resources	35
3 Livestock marketing	39
4 Diversification of pastoral economy	41
3 The political economy of pastoral change.....	43
1 Multiple marginalisation	44
1 Political marginalisation.....	44
2 Ecological marginalisation.....	46

2.	3.	1.	3	Economic marginalisation.....	48
		2		Manifestations of marginalisation.....	49
			1	Agriculture favoured at the expense of pastoralism.....	49
			2	Centralisation and political exclusion.....	52
		3		Competing interpretations of the multiple marginality of pastoralism.....	54
			1	'Cattle complex'.....	54
			2	'Tragedy of the commons'.....	55
		Notes		60
3				Pastoralism and development policy orientations in Ethiopia.....	61
		1		Introduction.....	61
		2		The general condition of nomadic pastoralists.....	62
		3		The pastoral areas in a national perspective.....	66
		4		History and evolution of pastoral development policies.....	67
			1	The development of large-scale commercial farms.....	69
			2	Development projects in the Upper, Middle and Lower valleys... ..	70
			3	Rangeland development projects.....	75
			4	Pastoral extension system.....	85
		5		Pastoral land tenure: An assessment of legal status and policies.....	86
			1	Legal status of pastoral areas.....	86
			2	Land reform legislation during the imperial period.....	87
			3	Land tenure issues during the military rule.....	90
			4	Land policy in the post <i>Derg</i> period.....	92
				1 The 1991 transitional economic policy and pastoral land.....	92
				2 The 1994 constitution and the pastoral land question.....	92
		6		Policy and policy outcomes.....	94
		7		Attempts to mitigate the problems of the pastoralists: A review of the experiences.....	97
			1	Settlement schemes.....	98
			2	The provision of irrigated pasture.....	100
		8		Concluding remarks.....	101
		Notes		104
4				The Karrayu system of livestock production.....	105
		1		Introduction.....	105
		2		Elements of the Karrayu subsistence economy.....	106
		3		Customary resource and herd management strategies.....	108
			1	Land use and access rights.....	108
			2	Vegetation and water resources.....	110
			3	Pastoral land-use pattern and system of transhumance.....	120

4. 3. 4	Herd composition	129
5	Livestock production	130
6	Herd management	132
7	Labour requirements and gender-based herding activities within the household	134
1	<i>Debrè</i> : An institution of milk stock transfer	137
4	Dependence on grain	140
5	Herd and flock marketing	142
6	Concluding summary	145
	Notes	148
5	Karrayu social and political structure: An overview	151
1	Introduction	151
2	History of origin	152
3	The household (<i>mennà</i>)	155
1	Marriage patterns	158
2	The dynamics and flexibility of the household	160
4	The homestead or extended family (<i>worra</i>)	163
5	The village (<i>genda</i>)	164
6	The tribal section (<i>gossa</i>)	164
7	Clans and lineages	166
8	Changing patterns in the Karrayu social structure	168
9	The Gada: A traditional politico-jural institution of the Karrayu	170
1	Traditional authority and the state	174
2	<i>Arrarra</i> : The traditional conflict-redressing institution	179
10	Concluding summary	184
	Notes	187
6	Large-scale interventions and the pastoral predicament:	
	Views of the Karrayu	189
1	Introduction	189
2	Conflict over land use	190
3	Relationships between the commercial farms and the pastoralists	193
1	The Metehara Sugar State and the Karrayu	193
2	The Nura Era Plantation and the Karrayu	202
4	Predicament caused by the commercial farms as perceived by the pastoralists	205
1	Loss of prime dry-season grazing	205
2	Deprivation of access to water sources	207
3	Displacement of the pastoralists	208

6. 4. 4	Enhanced vulnerability to drought	210
5	The Awash National Park in eyes of the pastoralists	213
1	Competing customary claims: The Park and the pastoralists.....	218
6	Concluding remarks	221
Notes	224
7	Karrayu pastoralism under pressure: Effects on the ecology	227
1	Introduction	227
2	Rangeland degradation and loss of vegetation: What do the Karrayu say?.....	230
1	Dispossession: At the heart of the environmental deterioration..	230
2	The state of the environment: Local interpretation	232
3	Town-based herding and livestock trading: The impact on the availability of livestock fodder	240
4	Resource-based inter-ethnic conflicts.....	244
1	Conflicts with the Arsi Oromo	247
2	Conflicts with the Afar	249
3	Conflicts with the Argoba	251
4	Conflicts with the Ittu.....	253
1	The case of the Gebella	255
5	Increase in water points and settlements and their implications for the range resources.....	256
1	Development versus conservation: Conflicting relationships	259
2	A note on community conservation	262
6	Concluding remarks.....	264
Notes	267
8	Socio-economic aspects of transformation in Karrayu society	271
1	Introduction	271
2	Recent trends in sedentarization.....	272
3	Transformation of the tenure system.....	275
1	The Akake Development Association.....	281
4	Pastoralists' exchange and marketing	285
5	Wage employment.....	296
6	Herder differentiation	300
1	The perception of wealth among the Karrayu	301
2	Economic differentiation and polarization	306
7	Economic transformation and the changing role of women.....	316
8	Concluding remarks.....	321
Annex 8.1	Average price of cattle	324

Annex 8.2	Average price of small-stock	324
Annex 8.3	Monthly retail price of maize (Birr per 100 kgs) and monthly retail price of goat (Birr per head).....	325
Notes	326
9	Change and continuity:	
	Pastoral survival and adaptive responses	329
1	Introduction	329
2	Combining pastoralism with agriculture	332
1	Aspects of agro-pastoralism in Karrayu neighborhoods: Taking a closer look at the practice and institutions	334
2	Access to labour: Inter-household cooperation	342
1	<i>Jiggie</i> : An institution of cooperative labour.....	344
2	The Arso-Arash institution.....	345
3	Hired labour	345
3	Access to oxen.....	346
1	Cattle entrustment	347
3	Constraints of agriculture as an adaptive response.....	348
4	The emergence and development of agro-pastoralism: A synthesis.....	353
5	Inter-regional movement: A form of camel pastoral adaptation	357
6	Increased mobility and dispersion	361
7	Cattle dispersal and social contracts.....	364
8	Sale of camel meat and milk	367
9	Concluding remarks.....	368
Notes	372
10	Conclusion	373
1	Main focus of the study	373
2	Summary of the main arguments.....	373
3	Revisiting the research problem: Land alienation – The force behind the Karrayu pastoral crisis and transformation.....	380
1	Sustenance crisis	381
2	Ecological disruption.....	383
3	Institutional disintegration.....	384
4	Karrayu pastoralism: Transformation and adaptation	385
5	Future prospects.....	387
References	391