PASTORALISM UNDER PRESSURE
PASTORALISM UNDER PRESSURE

Land alienation and pastoral transformations among the Karrayu of Eastern Ethiopia, 1941 to the present

A thesis submitted by

Ayalew Gebre
(Ethiopia)

in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES
Institute of Social Studies
The Hague, The Netherlands
November 2001
Thesis Committee

Promotores:

Professor M.R. Doornbos, Institute of Social Studies
Professor M.A.R.M. Salih, Institute of Social Studies

Examiners:

Professor Abdel Ghaffar M. Ahmed, Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa (OSSREA)
Professor J. Markakis, University of Crete
Professor J.B. Opschoor, Institute of Social Studies

This dissertation is part of the research program of CERES Research School for Resource Studies for Development
DEDICATION

In loving memory of my late mother Tadelech Ali, for showing me the firm ground and for the gift of her values. She has my eternal gratitude for all she had done for me. I feel very sad that she did not live to see that my efforts have finally come to fruition.
Acknowledgements

There are many people and institutions who contributed to bring this Ph.D. project to fruition and to whom I would like to use this space to express my gratitude. My first intellectual debt is to my doctoral promoters, Professor Martin Doornbos and Professor Mohamed Salih. The incisive comments they both gave me in my various draft chapters helped me to clarify my thinking enormously and prevent some serious missteps and to consider different, more interesting analytical and methodological insights. Their wise questions, suggestions and constructive critiques have rendered this dissertation a readable and acceptable piece of research. Moreover, the combination of tremendous trust and very optimistic attitude they bestowed upon me, in fact, were blessings for me to have ample intellectual space to maneuver and proceed with my research and finish it within more or less the required time frame.

I would also like to thank my field supervisor Professor Abdel Ghaffar Mohamed Ahmed, the Executive Secretary of the Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa, for his guidance, follow-up and his willingness to offer me his time during my stay for the field research in Ethiopia. I owe an enormous debt and my warmest thanks to my colleague Dr. Alula Pankhurst and my friend Dr. Awol Indris for the scholarly suggestions and editing they made on the draft manuscript. Many thanks indeed are due to Dr. Johan Helland, senior Research Fellow at Chr. Michelsen Institute, Norway, for his continues encouragement and keen interest he has been showing right from the inception of my idea for this study.

I must express my wholehearted gratitude to the Karrayu in general for sharing with me an invaluable wealth of their collective life experience and the hospitality shown me during the period of the field research. They graciously tolerated the probing and often perplexing questions of a student of pastoral anthropology. It will be difficult to single out all the Karrayu who assisted me with my research during my stay in their country. However, I am particularly
indebted to Hajji Qeseru Jillo, Hajji Gada Hollo, and Godana Jillo for the important role they played as key informants in supplying a bulk of the historical data for the study. Especially worth mentioning are the rich historical perspectives and detailed knowledge of the land issue that these individuals possess. Apart from this, I must thank Hajji Qeseru and his family for playing a host to the researcher at their homestead for most of the field period. Also deserving of my gratitude is Tedecho Borru who made a valuable contribution to the research as an interpreter, assistant and data collector. His co-operation and assistance in these capacities was valuable through the entire exercise of the field research.

During my period of fieldwork in Karrayu land, I enlisted the help of many organizations. I wish to acknowledge the support provided by the administration of the Metehara Sugar Estate, the Nura Era Plantation, the Awash National Park, and CARE-Awash for allowing me to have unhindered access to their archival materials and documents. The initial stage of my field research was made amenable due to the generous hospitality I received from the staff of CARE-Ethiopia at Awash Station. I am grateful to all of them.

I am grateful to the Institute of Social Studies (ISS) which kindly gave me the opportunity to undertake my Ph. D. research through the generous financial support of the Netherlands Fellowship Programme (NFP). I further wish to express my deep gratitude to the Department of Sociology and Social Administration, Addis Ababa University, for granting me a lengthy leave of absence to continue my study in the Netherlands.

I would like to take this moment to express my appreciation to the following individuals at ISS whose help has been of vital importance. Ank van den Berg, head of the students’ affairs, has always been very understanding and continually supportive throughout, and her pleasant and congenial personality gives zest to Ph.D. life at ISS. Special thanks are due to Dita Walenkamp, Maureen Koster, and Els van der Weele whose diligence and perseverance have been a constant source of optimism in the long Ph.D. trajectory. I cherish Wicky Meynen for her encouragement and words of comfort during the tough times when my work had been dampened by events outside my research.

At ISS, I had the opportunity to associate very good Ph.D. student colleagues that helped me to lessen the pain of being far away from home and escape the terrible loneliness when this was needed. Most of all, I cherish the good spirit and intellectual company of my year mates, Getnet Alemu, Richmond Tiemoko, Anne Karanja, Grace Fisit, Karin Gabriel, Najmi Yousaf, and Xiaoze Zang. I will also remember my friendship with Abebe Haile Gabriel, Terefe Degefa, Merera Gudina, Hayyalu Shiferaw, Merra Tegegne, Theodros Bekaffa, Mahmoud El Zain, Alex Izurieta, Ranjit Dwivedi, Maha Mahfouz, N.C. Narayayan, Imani Tafari, Men Ngo, P.K. Vijayan, Hannington
Odame, Claudius Preville, Omu Kakujaha, and Mathew Kurian. I also enjoyed the continues encouragement of the following friends outside ISS: Andualem Bezabih, Wondiferaw Ambaye, Aregawi Berhe, Emanuel Tolla, and Abera Aderaye.

The help, support and trust of many people in Ethiopia have allowed me to complete this work. These people are too numerous to list here. However, I owe a great deal to my sister in-laws Addisalem and Mulubrehan and brother in-laws Alebachew, Yihenew, Haileyesus and Amdebrehan. All those years they wholeheartedly stood by me, encouraging me to continue with my studies. My profound thanks go in particular to Sister Addisalem Kassie for comforting and in very many ways assisting my family during the entire period of my study leave abroad. My brother Tesfaye and my sister Fentaye I thank for their interest and encouragement.

Finally, nothing would have been possible were it not for my wife Tenagnework Kassie, who was always patient and emotionally supportive and appreciably endured the pain of separation longer than is perhaps justified. In effect, she has immensely assisted the writing of this dissertation by assuming a disproportionate share of the tasks of raising our two children, Mekbib and Dawit. Tenagnework has been more than just an understanding wife. She even sacrificed her own career to single-handedly shoulder the family responsibility. Her support and very loving partnership helped me to endure the most difficult times during this five-year long project. Last but not least, to my children – Mekbib and Dawit – I owe you a great deal for bearing my physical absence for a number of years calmly wondering when “Ayalew would finish his study in Holland”. You have been tender and very tolerant, willing to understand a father who was not able to share with you all the times you certainly deserve; and I lovingly beg your forgiveness for not being with you during times you needed my presence the most.

Ayalew Gebre
June 2001
The Hague
Contents

List of Maps, Tables and Figures .............................................................. xvii
Acronyms ............................................................................................................. xix
Glossary ................................................................................................................. xx1

1 Introduction ............................................................................................1
  1 Aim and scope of the study .................................................................1
  2 The research problem in context ...............................................................5
  3 Objectives of the study and working hypotheses ........................................7
  4 The research area .................................................................................8
  5 The people ...........................................................................................12
  6 Data material and research methodology .............................................14
    1 Written records and archival material ..........................................15
    2 Primary data collection based on fieldwork .................................16
      1 Problems and limitations ...............................................................16
      2 Units of data collection and analysis ...........................................17
      3 Types of data and methods .........................................................18
    3 Data analysis ................................................................................23
  7 Fieldwork experience and motivation ...............................................24
  8 Organization of the book ...................................................................26
  Notes ........................................................................................................29

2 Some considerations on the transformation of nomadic pastoral
societies: A theoretical overview .......................................................... 31
  1 Introduction ........................................................................................ 31
  2 The changing context of pastoralism .................................................. 32
    1 Pastoral land tenure ....................................................................... 33
    2 Commercialisation of pastoral resources ...................................... 35
    3 Livestock marketing .................................................................... 39
    4 Diversification of pastoral economy ............................................. 41
  3 The political economy of pastoral change .......................................... 43
    1 Multiple marginalisation ............................................................... 44
      1 Political marginalisation ............................................................. 44
      2 Ecological marginalisation ......................................................... 46
### Contents

#### 2. 3. 1. 3 Economic marginalisation ........................................................... 48

2 Manifestations of marginalisation ......................................................... 49
   1 Agriculture favoured at the expense of pastoralism ......................... 49
   2 Centralisation and political exclusion .............................................. 52

3 Competing interpretations of the multiple marginality of pastoralism ............................. 54
   1 ‘Cattle complex’ ............................................................................. 54
   2 ‘Tragedy of the commons’ ............................................................. 55

Notes .................................................................................................... 60

#### 3 Pastoralism and development policy orientations in Ethiopia .................. 61

1 Introduction ......................................................................................... 61

2 The general condition of nomadic pastoralists ..................................... 62

3 The pastoral areas in a national perspective ......................................... 66

4 History and evolution of pastoral development policies ....................... 67
   1 The development of large-scale commercial farms ......................... 69
   2 Development projects in the Upper, Middle and Lower valleys .... 70
   3 Rangeland development projects ................................................... 75

4 Pastoral extension system ................................................................. 85

5 Pastoral land tenure: An assessment of legal status and policies .......... 86
   1 Legal status of pastoral areas ......................................................... 86
   2 Land reform legislation during the imperial period ....................... 87
   3 Land tenure issues during the military rule .................................... 90

4 Land policy in the post Derg period ................................................... 92
   1 The 1991 transitional economic policy and pastoral land .......... 92
   2 The 1994 constitution and the pastoral land question ................. 92

6 Policy and policy outcomes ............................................................... 94

7 Attempts to mitigate the problems of the pastoralists: 
   A review of the experiences ........................................................... 97
      1 Settlement schemes ................................................................. 98
      2 The provision of irrigated pasture .............................................. 100

8 Concluding remarks ......................................................................... 101

Notes .................................................................................................. 104

#### 4 The Karrayu system of livestock production .................................. 105

1 Introduction ....................................................................................... 105

2 Elements of the Karrayu subsistence economy .................................. 106

3 Customary resource and herd management strategies ....................... 108
   1 Land use and access rights ......................................................... 108
   2 Vegetation and water resources .................................................. 110

3 Pastoral land-use pattern and system of transhumance .................... 120
# Contents

4. 3. 4 Herd composition ........................................................................ 129  
5 Livestock production ......................................................................... 130  
6 Herd management ............................................................................. 132  
7 Labour requirements and gender-based herding activities  
within the household ......................................................................... 134  
1 *Debrè*: An institution of milk stock transfer .................................... 137  
4 Dependence on grain ........................................................................ 140  
5 Herd and flock marketing ...................................................................... 142  
6 Concluding summary ........................................................................... 145  
Notes ........................................................................................................ 148  

5 *Karrayu social and political structure: An overview* .......................... 151  
1 Introduction ........................................................................................... 151  
2 History of origin ................................................................................... 152  
3 The household (*mennà*) ..................................................................... 155  
1 Marriage patterns ............................................................................... 158  
2 The dynamics and flexibility of the household ...................................... 160  
4 The homestead or extended family (*worra*) ........................................ 163  
5 The village (*genda*) ........................................................................... 164  
6 The tribal section (*gossa*) ................................................................... 164  
7 Clans and lineages ............................................................................. 166  
8 Changing patterns in the Karrayu social structure .................................. 168  
9 The Gada: A traditional politico-jural institution of the Karrayu............ 170  
1 Traditional authority and the state ..................................................... 174  
2 *Arrarra*: The traditional conflict-redressing institution ......................... 179  
10 Concluding summary ......................................................................... 184  
Notes ........................................................................................................ 187  

6 *Large-scale interventions and the pastoral predicament:  
Views of the Karrayu* ........................................................................ 189  
1 Introduction ........................................................................................... 189  
2 Conflict over land use .......................................................................... 190  
3 Relationships between the commercial farms and the  
pastoralists ........................................................................................ 193  
1 The Metehara Sugar State and the Karrayu ........................................... 193  
2 The Nura Era Plantation and the Karrayu ............................................ 202  
4 Predicament caused by the commercial farms as perceived by  
the pastoralists .................................................................................... 205  
1 Loss of prime dry-season grazing ....................................................... 205  
2 Deprivation of access to water sources ........................................... 207  
3 Displacement of the pastoralists ..................................................... 208
6. Enhanced vulnerability to drought .............................................. 210
5 The Awash National Park in eyes of the pastoralists .............. 213
   1 Competing customary claims: The Park and the pastoralists ...................................................... 218
6 Concluding remarks ..................................................................... 221
Notes .......................................................................................... 224

7 Karrayu pastoralism under pressure: Effects on the ecology ...... 227
   1 Introduction .............................................................................. 227
   2 Rangeland degradation and loss of vegetation: What do the Karrayu say? .............................................. 230
      1 Dispossession: At the heart of the environmental deterioration ...................................................... 230
      2 The state of the environment: Local interpretation ................................................................. 232
   3 Town-based herding and livestock trading: The impact on the availability of livestock fodder ....... 240
   4 Resource-based inter-ethnic conflicts ............................................. 244
      1 Conflicts with the Arsi Oromo ...................................................... 247
      2 Conflicts with the Afar .............................................................. 249
      3 Conflicts with the Argoba ......................................................... 251
      4 Conflicts with the Ittu .............................................................. 253
      1 The case of the Gebella .......................................................... 255
   5 Increase in water points and settlements and their implications for the range resources .............................................. 256
      1 Development versus conservation: Conflicting relationships .................................................. 259
      2 A note on community conservation .............................................................................. 262
   6 Concluding remarks ................................................................. 264
Notes .......................................................................................... 267

8 Socio-economic aspects of transformation in Karrayu society ...... 271
   1 Introduction .............................................................................. 271
   2 Recent trends in sedentarization .............................................................................. 272
   3 Transformation of the tenure system .............................................................................. 275
      1 The Akake Development Association ...................................................... 281
   4 Pastoralists’ exchange and marketing ................................................................. 285
   5 Wage employment .............................................................................. 296
   6 Herder differentiation ........................................................................... 300
      1 The perception of wealth among the Karrayu ................................................................. 301
      2 Economic differentiation and polarization .............................................................................. 306
   7 Economic transformation and the changing role of women ...................................................... 316
   8 Concluding remarks ........................................................................... 321
Annex 8.1 Average price of cattle ...................................................... 324